DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 238 057 CS 504 475

AUTHOR Hanson, Gail
TITLE The Executive Woman: Rhetorical Visions in "Management Review," 1951-1981.
PUB DATE 11 Nov 83
NOTE 32p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Speech Communication Association (69th, Washington, DC, November 10-13, 1983).
PUB TYPE Speeches/Conference Papers (150) -- Reports - Research/Technical (143)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Attitude Change; Business Administration; Communication Research; Content Analysis; *Employed Women; Leadership Qualities; Males; Management Development; *Managerial Occupations; *Organizational Communication; *Periodicals; Personnel Evaluation; Sex Bias; Sex Differences; *Social Change
IDENTIFIERS *Dramatistic Criticism; Management Review (Journal)

ABSTRACT

To examine the attitudes of management literature toward female managers, 27 articles published in "Management Review" between 1951 and 1981 were subjected to both content analysis and fantasy theme analysis with attention to dramatistic plot elements. Used to identify and categorize prominent themes, content analysis revealed three major clusters of topics: the statistical presence of women managers, special problems they face, and their perceived masculinity or femininity. Qualitative analysis showed that the earliest articles presented the exposition of characters, setting, motives, and conflict involved in women's bids for management positions. The next series of articles comprised the discovery section, showing that women had business strengths as well as liabilities. Articles suggesting a reversal of expectations for women's success in management followed. The point of attack, initiating the process of change, could be seen in articles following the passage of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. The climax, which was found in two articles published in 1978 and 1980 that suggested that modern corporations needed managers blending male and female qualities, was followed by a crisis in an article that asked if management would open its doors to new talent. The remaining articles presented the beginning of the denouement with some suggestions of what corporations were already doing to bring women into the corporate enclave. (Appended are a list of the articles used and data from the content analysis.) (MM)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

X This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

ED238057

The Executive Woman:

Rhetorical Visions in Management Review, 1951-1981

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Gail Hanson

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

Gail Hanson
Department of Speech Communication
University of Minnesota
Minneapolis, Minnesota 55455

Presented at the Sixty-Ninth Annual Meeting
of the Speech Communication Association, Women's Caucus
November 11, 1983, Washington, D. C.

CS 504 475

The Executive Woman:

Rhetorical Visions in Management Review, 1951-1981

Background

Research interest in women in management has surged in the ten years following the passage of the Equal Employment Act of 1972, which amended the Civil Rights Act of 1964. Title VII of the 1972 Equal Employment Act extended prohibition of sex discrimination to all aspects of employment. At the time of its introduction the sex discrimination prohibition was thought to have been introduced as an "attempt to make the [Equal Employment Act] appear ludicrous and thus to defeat it" (Cassio, 1978, p.18).

There is little that now seems ludicrous regarding sex discrimination of women in management. While women have made progress in their aspirations toward corporate leadership, they are still under represented in management positions relative to their number in the work force as well as relative to the number of men in similar positions. According to statistics from the U. S. Department of Labor (1968,1980), in 1954 women comprised about 31% of the labor force, but only 15% of management. In 1979 women represented 40% of the work force and 25% of management. There have certainly been gains over the past 25 years, but women are still underrepresented in management.

The question of women in management has been explored from many points of view. Hennig and Jardim (1977) examined the personal, educational, and professional histories of 25 executive women, exploring the determinants of female corporate success. Kanter (1977) investigated the socialization of women within corporate structures. Terborg (1977) reviewed research on women in management with special attention to their entry and socialization. Koester (1980) applied the techniques of fantasy theme analysis to an examination of popular managerial advice books directed to women aspiring to managerial success. Leavitt and Lipman-Blumen (1980) looked at the managerial process itself and attempted to deliniate the ways in which the presence of women had influenced the process.

This study will employ message analysis to look at management literature, not the literature of research nor of managerial advice books. Aimed at the working management professional, a specialized audience, this literature is part of the common culture, the mass communications of the management community. Gerbner describes message analysis as "an approach based on a conception of message systems as the common culture through which communities cultivate shared and public notions about facts, values and contingencies of human existence" (1969, p. 123). The approach of this study is based on the belief that the literature of popular management periodicals contributes to the common culture through which the management community has shared and cultivated its notions about women managers. The relevant questions are: 1) what attitudes toward female managers

are reflected in this literature? 2) have the attitudes changed or modified over time and, if so, in what ways? and 3) are the themes that are present in management literature the same as those in research literature or in managerial advice literature?

Methodology

Business Periodicals Index lists articles under the subject title of "women executives." An almost exponential increase in articles on this topic has occurred since 1972. It is interesting to note that the topic heading changed in 1975 from "women as executives" to the present "women executives," as if in 1975 women were no longer playing a role as executives but truly were executives.

The periodicals represented under this heading were tallied to determine which were cited most frequently. Two periodicals emerged with the most frequency: Management Review and Personnel Journal. Management Review was selected for analysis because 1) it has been published by the American Management Association since 1923 and as such can be presumed to reasonably represent the view of management professionals, and 2) through the years it has consistently had more articles on the topic than any other management periodical.

In all, twenty-seven articles (listed chronologically in Appendix A and henceforth referred to by number) from Management Review were identified as relevant to the topic, a total of eighty-five pages published in the thirty-one years from January 1951 to December 1981. The number of articles and their increasing length through the years testify to the growth of

interest in this topic. During the decade of the 50s there were only five articles totaling seven pages, about 1.4 pages per article. In the 60s there were just seven articles, but they were longer, totaling twenty-five pages, an average of 3.6 pages per article. In the 70s ten articles appeared, thirty-three pages in all, 3.3 pages per article. The first two years of the 80s saw the appearance of four articles totaling eighteen pages, in just two years more than half the total of all of the previous decade, an increase in articles and pages that, if it continues, would seem significant.

Once the articles were identified, two approaches were used for analysis, one quantitative in nature, the other more impressionistic and qualitative.

Content analysis was used as an initial devise to identify and categorize the predominant themes that appear in the articles and to provide a body of information for further analysis. Content analysis also allowed the comparison of themes from management literature to the themes of managerial research (Terborg, 1977) and to the themes of managerial advice literature (Koester,1980).

Content analysis, however, when applied to such a long historical span of literature, seems a piece meal approach, a means of looking at the parts but missing the whole. Even though these articles appeared over a thirty year period and were not intended to be related, it seems appropriate to look at them as a totality, as if they were the scenes and acts of an unfolding drama which achieves fullest effectiveness only when experienced

as a whole. The articles when taken together form what Nye has called a mosiac, a mosaic formed by putting together "a discontinuous series of events and characters, separated by time and space, juxtaposed in a pattern that is no longer accidental as the reader imposes his own design on the experience" (1971, p.1033). To form this mosaic the study attempts to integrate the techniques of Bormann's fantasy theme analysis (1972) with dramatistic plot elements suggested by Hatlen (1972).

Content Analysis

Content analysis is essentially a specialized method of measuring message content. As applied to mass communication it is an attempt to draw representative inferences from a collection of published messages. Publication in this case is the "creation and cultivation of shared ways of selecting and viewing events and aspects of life" (Gerbner, 1969, p. 125). The publications of interest here are those of management literature. What attitudes, events and aspects of and about managerial women were selected and presented in the collectively shared public message systems of popular management literature?

The unit of analysis was similar to the "act" as described by Bales, "A communication. . . which in its context may be understood . . . as equivalent to a single simple sentence" (1970, p. 68). Complex sentences containing multiple thought units were coded separately. However, not all thought units from the articles were coded. To reduce the material to a manageable amount, background and introductory material, examples and narratives were eliminated from content analysis. Such

material was reexamined using dramatistic analysis. Material for content analysis thus included all thought units which were clearly relevant to the topic, either initial statements, restatements, clarifications or embellishments of attitudes toward managerial women. Each relevant thought unit was recorded separately. When all units were identified, each was reread and coded according to a primary content category. Content categories were thus built empirically as they appeared. Finally, thought units were filed according to content category and each category was checked for internal consistency. Infrequently referenced categories--those that occurred in fewer than five thought units--were eliminated from further consideration.

Thirteen categorical content areas were thus identified. Table 1, Appendix B, lists each content category with the scope (number of articles) and the intensity (number of thought units) of each category. Both scores are necessary in evaluating the strength of each content theme because some appeared frequently but with little development, as if they were basic assumptions which required no further argument. Other themes appeared in relatively few articles but were the central focus of the articles in which they appeared.

The major content themes that emerge from content analysis cluster into three groupings: 1) those that deal with issues concerning the statistical <u>presence</u> of women managers, 2) those that deal with issues concerning the <u>special problems</u>, liabilities and prejudices faced by women managers, and 3) those

that deal with the issues relative to the perceived masculinity or femininity of women managers.

Content Cluster I. Presence Issues

Four themes comprise this cluster: women managers are increasing, women are underrepresented in management, opportunities for women in management are increasing, and some jobs are especially suitable for women as managers. Generally these themes have broad scope; that is, they appear in one form or another in at least half of the articles. However, except for the concept opportunities for women in managerment are increasing, they have rather low intensity; that is they are presented with little development or elaboration. The basic content of the cluster can be summarized by the statement that women have made progress in management opportunities but are still behind in achieving parity with men. Labor statistics cited earlier support that this indeed is the case.

The opportunities theme, however, has intensity as well as scope; perhaps it required repetition and elaboration to achieve credibility. The opportunities theme is stated differently through the years. Early articles note an impending shortage of male managers: women are needed to fill the gap (2, 9, 10, 12). Later articles stress that management needs the skills that women offer (19, 23). The idea that some jobs are more suitable for women managers--such as personnel, retail, and public relations--is present in early articles but fades out after 1969 (1, 7, 10).

Terborg's research review (1977) reports no studies that deal specifically with opportunities for women. He did find

research indicating that women managers are often found in dead-end jobs, have low status jobs, and occupy positions outside of usual career paths. Terborg also reports that women generally experience lack of family support and encouragement for choosing non-traditional careers. Those who eventually choose non-traditional careers tend to also reject stereotypical sex roles.

Koester's study of managerial advice books (1980) found that the primary rhetorical visions of those books were built on the assumption that "the opportunity for women to be successful managers exists within the present legal, social and organizational framework" (p. 116). That this theme persists in both popular and management literature, despite statistics to the contrary, is evidence of its strength as a rhetorical vision.

Content Cluster II: Special Problem Issues

This cluster attempts to explain the relative lack of success of women in management. Reasons range from the notion that business is a man's world and prejudice and tradition within this male business world are strong inhibiting forces (2, 7, 19, 20, 22, 23), to the notion that women as women have liabilities and face special problems. This latter theme is expressed in many different ways, with both assertions and denials. Women are portrayed as lacking desire and motivation (2, 6, 9, 10, 13), as having conflicting home and family responsibilities (2, 3, 5, 7, 11, 12, 17, 21), as being too emotional (2, 12, 25), as lacking training (2, 3, 4, 14, 19, 20), and as lacking aggressiveness and leadership skills (2, 3, 4, 14, 19, 20). Although some articles argue against the prevailing

themes of female inability (11, 12, 13) and business world prejudice (3, 9, 10, 16, 18), these themes are nonetheless pervasive in both scope and intensity. Because of these special problems, women managers are further characterized as needing to excel in order to succeed (5, 6, 7, 9, 11, 13, 16, 17).

Themes from this cluster are also found in research literature. Although Terborg (1977) found no studies specifically designed to identify the specific problems faced by women entering management, he did find that "compared to men, women are rated less desirable for management positions, are extended few job offers and receive lower salaries " (p. 649). Terborg also reports that "most working women probably are not qualified for management positions . . . [because] cumulative effects of past discrimination have prevented women from gaining necessary skills and experience" (p. 649). Bowmen, Worth, and Greyson (1965) found that even when women were perceived as capable they were not judged desirable for management because of anticipated resistance by coworkers.

Kanter's work (1977) also supports the view that the impediments to women's success lie in the system rather than in the individual, a view echoed in this cluster by the theme of the inhibiting power of prejudice and tradition.

Koester's analysis (1980) found two dominant rhetorical visions, both of which relate to the themes of this cluster. Koester's manager vision stresses that the keys to success lie in mastery of the managerial job. Once the job is mastered, according to this vision, success is almost guaranteed. This

vision does not recognize the impediments of prejudice and tradition. Koester's female manager vision does, however recognize that women face a series of obstacles in achieving success. However, in this vision the locus of control for success still remains within the woman herself. "If a woman can simply figure out the appropriate rules and responses in these situations, she will be able to retain the control necessary to accomplish success" (p. 69). Much of Koester's female manager vision deals with the issue of femininity, a theme from the next content cluster.

Content Cluster III: Femininity/Masculinity Issues

Themes within this cluster have some commonality with those in the previous cluster which suggest that women as women have limiting characteristics. This cluster, however, deals more specifically with the role expectations of and for women in management, such as the dilemma of if or how to maintain femininity within a traditionally masculine role (3, 4, 6, 8, 9, 10, 16, 19, 22, 23), the question of whether women have traditional sex role characteristics which are management strengths (4, 5, 9, 10, 11, 12, 19), or whether the behavioral characteristics of women managers are essentially the same as those for men (6, 10, 11, 12, 16, 18, 23, 24). A theme that begins in the late 60s and gains strength in the 70s is that of the "androgynous" manager, the notion that contentemporary corporations need management with skills drawn from both male and female characteristics (10, 11, 12, 17, 23, 25, 26).

Terborg (1977) found many research studies that investigated sex role stereotypes in business. Terborg also found that a common theme in research literature centers on the lack of congruency between perceptions of the traditional feminine sex role and women's behaviors and performance in nontraditional, masculine jobs. Relative to the issue of androgyny, a study by Powell and Butterfield (1979) failed to support the hypothesis that a good manager would be seen as androgynous, rather "good managers" continue to be described in masculine terms.

According to Koester (1980), "the essential distinguishing features of the female manager vision is that [managerial advice] authors make gender the ultimate factor which gives meaning and coherence to events. . . .The woman manager is a women first and a manager second. . . . The basic scenario of the successful woman implies that she must walk a fine line between always being a women, but not behaving 'like a woman' and conforming to the myths" (pp. 60-61). The femininity/masculinity themes found in this research thus echo those found by Koester.

Table 1, Appendix B, which summarizes the finding of content analysis, indicates that there is a commonality of themes represented in the twenty-seven articles of this study. These themes, however, shift in emphasis over the years. Early articles are more likely to stress the liabilities and special problems of women managers. Middle articles tend to see women as similar to men in management. Later articles look at the special qualities which women bring to management. The next section of

this paper will examine how these themes may be interpreted as forming a unified rhetorical vision and dramatization.

Dramatization

When one looks at the twenty-seven articles of this study as if they were the elements of a continuously unfolding drama gather than separate, unconnected articles, one begins to see dramatic elements emerge--the scenes, acts, characters, actions, and motivations of a play. As an organizational design for analysis, the plot elements suggested by Hatlen (1972) are used here rather than the more traditional organization of acts and scenes because they are more descriptive. The elements of this design are those of exposition, discovery, reversal, point of attack, foreshadowing, climax, crisis and denouement.

Exposition

The task of exposition in drama is to set the stage, to introduce characters and relationships, motives and conflicts. The first article of this study, January 1951, provides both the setting and the conflict: a business world with increasing opportunities for women in management, a world in which women are taking advantage of these opportunities, but, nonetheless, a world where prejudice and tradition operate against women:

> Many higher-level positions that were in former years considered "men's jobs," are today being held by women. . . .but only in department stores was there an even distribution of such jobs among men and women. . . . World War II had opened new opportunities for women, ... men realize that prejudice and tradition often prevent their making full use of women's skills, ... That so many firms have discovered how much can be gained by helping women develop and use their talents, should be a challenge to others to do the same (1, pp. 16-17).

The second article, March 1954, continues these introductory themes, but in a much more dramatic form, with more metaphor, more narration, more satire and more conflict:

> Outwardly, but only outwardly, American business has become strongly feminized. . . . The U.S. office landscape is full of wire bras, pancake makeup, and clouds of Chanel No. 5 rising from filing cabinets. . . . Nevertheless, there are not enough top women executives in the U.S. today to form a medium-sized chorus line. . . . Despite the pioneer days, which helped make the American female more independent than any other female this side of New Guinea, . . . U.S. men feel uneasy working for women (2. p. 140).

The condescending, derisive tone of the article continues. We are introduced to a "handful of outstanding women [who] hold important corporate jobs:" "Mrs." Mildred McAfee Horton, a director of NBC and RCA; Tillie Lewis, "fortyish, red-haired" president of Flotill Products. Women, we are told, have succeeded in "feminine" fields or in fields where "their eye for detail is useful" (2, p. 140).

According to this article the corporate male's view of the corporate woman is not one consonant with leadership:

> The American male ideal of woman's place in business is symbolized by the All American Secretary (also known as the Daytime Wife), . . .She is a nylon version of the ancient dream of woman as man's helpmate, companion, housekeeper, ego-builder and aspirin-bearer (2, pp. 140-141).

According to this male view, women haven't made it as executives for "excellent" reasons:

> Women lack technical aptitude and muscle power, . . . The career they are really interested in is marriage. "By the time you have spent a lot of time and money training them for executive jobs," says a Seattle department-store man, "Some guy grabs them off or they get pregnant or something." . . .They are too emotional. . . . "You can't talk to women the way you do to men. You hate to have them cry" (2, p. 140).

This article, however negative toward women it seems, ends by reiterating a theme that will be repeated again and again as the drama proceeds:

> There is more room for women executives. . . . there will not be enough qualified men to fill the responsible positions and women are going to be received in top jobs out of necessity (2, p. 141).

Given the ambivalence and conflict inherent in this impending reception, whatever its necessity, it is clear that the ensuing scenes of this drama will have much to resolve.

The next article, May 1956, develops the female character further. We are given more portrayals of successful women, still, however, in a derisive tone: Mrs. Lucille Kurtz, "blonde grandmother;" Rose Lunn, "chief vibration and flutter engineer;" Mrs. Olive Ann Beech, president of Beech Aircraft, but supposedly "baffled" by machinery (3, p. 314).

Conflict is heightened by the addition of still more impediments to the heroines' success:

> Women find it hard to get the broad training that large corporations demand of their top men. . . . It is the woman who stays home when the children become ill (3, p. 315).

As in a drama, these early articles create suspense concerning the possibility of the ultimate triumph of the heroine, in this case the management woman.

Discovery

In discovery the audience is helped to recognize the differences between appearance and reality, between what is expected and what actually occurs. In the next series of articles we discovery that women have strengths as well as liabilities.

We learn that research has found that, contrary to expectations, successful women are practical, have organizational skill, sensitivity to people, adaptability, energy, confidence, and interest in achievement (4). We find that there are other advantages for women executives, such as customer and employee acceptance, sex appeal, attractive appearance, and motivation (5).

We discover still more about the motivation of the heroine of the drama, the female executive: female executives are motivated less by economic factors than by office politics and prestige factors:

> What allows women to get to the top is exactly what allows men. However, the woman needs a little extra ability to overcome the traditional barriers to her sex (6, p. 60).

The articles begin to suggest that there is hope for the female executive after all. A "little extra ability" isn't too much to ask of a heroine.

Reversal

Reversal is "a change of fortune in the action of the play to the opposite state of affairs" (Hatlen, 1972, p. 37). As the articles progress, we no sooner come to believe that women might succeed in management, then that faith is undermined:

> Despite these gains by women, management remains predominantly a man's world. . . . "We don't have ladies' rooms in steel mills." . . . prejudice against them persists . . .because of well founded fear that they will depart to raise a family just as they learn the job. . . . It takes exceptional drive to overcome such attitudes. . . . "A woman never makes it to the top unless she dedicates her life to her career." . . . women frequently bring special problems. . . . says a Dallas business man, "I don't think women belong in business" (, pp. 38-39).

Thus the themes of prejudice, inhibiting tradition, liabilities and special problems requiring exceptional skill to combat continue to be presented through the scenes of the drama presented by these articles.

The possibility of an even more dramatic and opposite reversal is suggested in this bit of comic relief entitled "Executive Sweet:"

> More and yet more of the feminine sex
> Are filling positions as top-rung execs,
> And heading the companies formerly headed
> By men. It is something we always have dreaded.
>
> Be the stronger sex weaker or weaker sex stronger,
> The time has arrived that we hoped would take longer,
> When the desk of the boss during business hours
> Instead of cigars sports a vase full of flowers.
>
> And along with the pens and the pencils and clips
> (Instead of the golf tees and horse-racing tips)
> Are lipsticks and bridge scores, a coral-pink phone
> Some gloves, and a bottle of Eau de Cologne.
>
> If this is the case, we'd be wise not to scoff
> At the thought that the time is not very far off
> When the boss tells the steno, who works like a slave,
> "Put out that cigar," and "You do need a shave." (8)

The portrayal of the woman executive as a slightly comic character is repeated through the rhetoric of many of these early articles. However, with this article in 1963 the comedy ceases. Events are set in motion that cause women in business to be taken much more seriously.

Point of Attack

The point of attack is "that moment in the play in which the precipitating force sets the mechanism in motion" (Hatlen, 1972, p. 37). It initiates the process of change.

For women in management that moment was passage of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. Not coincidentally, in 1964 references to federal actions begin to appear in the articles of this study (9, 10, 11, 12, 13). Articles also begin to once again question the earlier assumptions about women's liabilities as managers, at first grudgingly, later more enthusiastically:

> Surely women are no more temperamental, show no less initiative, reach no more erroneous conclusions from vague directions and become no more bogged down in details than computers. Women can't be as stupid as computers (11, pp. 60-61).

> "Women are emotional and get disturbed when they are pressured or critized." Perhaps. But a woman could not have achieved her professional stature and education if she were unduly temperamental (13, p. 22).

Articles also begin to suggest methods for bringing women into management: management training and development (11, 12, 14), special incentive programs (15, 18, 21), behavioral guidelines (16), and time management strategies (17). Women finally seem to be on the move in management; corporations are looking at whey they can do to attract and develop competent women. These middle articles suggest that the heroine of the drama is finally launched.

Climax

The climax is "the culmination of the course of action" (Hatlen, 1972, p. 40). In the drama of the woman executive as presented in this series of articles from management literature, the climax is reached with the publication of two articles, that of October 1978 entitled "The androgynous blend: best of both worlds?" and that of November 1980 entitled "Women in management:

can it be a renaissance for everybody?" The theme that modern corporations need a new kind of manager, a blend of both male and female traits had been suggested earlier (10, 11, 12, 16). In these two articles, however, this theme reaches full development. We find that:

> The effective manager is seen as someone with both leadership skills and supporting and helping behaviors. . . . This could develop androgynous managers--people who have learned and value both "masculine" and "feminine" behaviors (19, p. 61), . . . It is critical that both sexes have opportunities to develop adrogynous behavior, free of sex-role constraints, if they are to work effectively within the new workforce and with human relations styles of management (p. 65).

The theme is repeated in the second of these articles and is expanded with narration and dramatization, but conflict is once again present in this rhetorical vision:

> Ironically, women who have lost sight of their greatest strengths and have once again been seduced by men's values--power and money--seem not to realize that the system they have adapted themselves to is a dying one (p. 46). . . . Gordon Rattay Taylor, in his book Rethink, . . . is convinced that there is a swing toward matrism in our society. . . . Women who try so hard to avoid "throwing like a girl" could be warming up with the losing team (p. 47).

In the climax of this drama we find that women have worked hard, corporate society has changed in accommodating ways, the androgynous model welcomes women, and yet uneasiness remains. Perhaps women have finally learned the corporate game only to find that the rules have changed.

Crisis

Although crisis and climax are terms that are often used interchangeably and often occur simultaneously in drama, a crisis is more a "time of decision, a turning point, a crossroads" (Hatlen, 1972, p. 41). In the drama of the executive woman the

crisis is clear, not only because of its dramatic characteristics, but also because of its editorial presentation: article 25, July 1981, "Rites of passage. . . . women for the inner circle," is a cover story, the first on the topic of women executives to be so featured in Management Review.

The crisis scene is set dramatically. On the cover we see the back of a woman who is dressed in a blue business suit, carrying a briefcase, and entering an executive office. In the background three surpised men cower behind a desk. The woman is a powerful figure, in cover space twice as big as the three men altogether. Inside the magazine, however, an alternate scene is enacted. Across the two title pages of this feature article stride four men, dressed in dark, crisp business suits, with shiny shoes and sturdy briefcases; following at a distance is a lone woman in a rumpled cotton dress, also carrying a brief case but wearing shoes clearly unsuited to long distances. The images of the cover and the title pages are clearly contradictory. One wonders which image will prevail.

The article itself is full of elaborately developed and detailed male metaphors: the prehistoric, sacred, men-only cave, the athletic talent scout and the team coach.

The first scene of the article is that of the male cave, a sacred place from which women are excluded:

> Since ancient times societies have had institutions that were restricted to men. . . . The entrance was guarded, a secret sign was needed to gain admittance, and young males waited anxiously for the day they, too, could belong. . . . The primitive men's hut of old has . . . survived handily into the decade of the 80's . . . Thousands of corporate board rooms that exclude women are visible evidence that

> masculine genes still produce a survival mind set that has long since served its usefulness (pp. 8, 9).

The next scene is three vignettes, dramatizations of the male vision of corporate women: Kaye is a "blonde" sales rep, a woman who has won top sales awards and client appreciation only to be cheated of a commission, her complaint unheard because of "emotionalism;" next is the familiar story of Mary Cunningham, the Harvard MBA graduate whose fast track success at Bendix aroused rumors of sexual improprieties; finally there is Donna, bright and hardworking, but still the "little girl" of her boss, unable to work on her own. Women, according to this article, are still viewed by corporate men as sexual partners or children, not as equals.

This article, however, does not end with the inner door to the sacred cave closed forever. It extends the cave man metaphor to include the image of the scout, not the scout of old who searched for game and watched for enemies, although that image would by consistent with the vignettes presented here. No, the modern scout is drawn from the fields of entertainment and professional sports. Males of the inner circle are advised by this article that they can best serve their corporations by finding potential female talent and then "coaching" that talent toward success.

Which will it be? The closed door or the search for talent? The remaining acts and scenes from the articles must finish the drama.

Denouement

The denouement is the part of the play from the climax and crisis to the final curtain. It is "the end of the play, the final resolution of the difficulties that have been raised" (Hatlen, 1972, p. 42). In the drama presented in the remaining articles, however, the denouement has just begun, as if this were a five act play with only the first three acts and part of the fourth written.

The fourth act begins with article 26, November 1981, entitled "Will he--or won't he--work with a female manager?" The article describes an instrument designed to identify management men who can work effectively with women. It is an instrument designed to identify the talent scounts and coaches of the previous article. The final article of the series describes what some corporations are already doing to bring women onto corporate boards, to open the doors of the corporate conclave.

Conclusion

The play is by no means over, but the twenty-seven "scenes" from management literature examined for this study have set the stage, introduced and developed conflicting characters and conflicting motives, and have set actions in motions. Content analysis of the articles found many common themes in these articles, themes that were echoed in both research literature and popular managerial advice literature.

Women in organizational leadership have had to master not only management skills, but also the difficulties of being female in a predominantly male corporate culture. As women managers

have become increasingly evident in the corporate world, attitudes toward them, as represented in the management literature reviewed here, have changed. Women in the later articles are viewed more positively, with more to offer the modern organization. But prejudices and inhibiting traditions very definitely still remain.

This study looked at only one management periodical. One might look at other management periodicals to determine if the themes identified here are present in other periodicals as well. This study was also limited to articles which dealt with executive women specifically. It would be worthwhile to examine the vision of other corporate women, those not of the executive rank, presented in other articles in management literature.

Appendix A

CHRONOLOGICAL, ANNOTATED LISTING OF ARTICLES FROM MANAGEMENT REVIEW, 1951-1981 CONCERNING WOMEN IN MANAGEMENT

/1/ Women in higher positions--a survey. Management Review, January 1951, 40, 16-17. (From Women in Higher Level Positions. Bulletin No. 236, Women's Bureau, United States Department of Labor, 1950)

Two trends emerge from a receent government study: many more higher level jobs are now being held by women and management is recognizing that women should be judged on merit.

/2/ Women executives? Plenty in Tchambuli! Management Review, March 1954, 43, 140-141. (From Time, January 11, 1954, 72.)

The American business community is male dominated, outwardly feminized, but actually with few female executives. Soon there will be a scarcity of men for top positions: women will be needed to fill the void.

/3/ Women executives: their day is coming. Management Review, May 1956, 45, 313-315. (From Newsweek, February 27, 1956, 76)

Women executives haven't yet arrived but will. Women have intelligence and aptitude but lack the necessary background and education for management.

/4/ Hamill, Katherine. Women as bosses. Management Review, June 1956, 45, 624-625. (From Fortune, June 1956, 105).

There are increasingly more women in executive jobs; barriers are diminishing.

/5/ Do women make good executives? Management Review, March 1958, 47, 88.

Male executives tend to see women as being disadvantaged in management.

/6/ Mercer, Marilyn. What makes Gertrude run? The women executive in fact and fiction. Management Review, April 1960, 49, 59-60. (From The New York Herald Tribune, February 29, 1960).

The motivations of the female executive are sometimes financial but more often political and prestige factors.

/7/ The growing role of women executives. Management Review, April 1963, 52, 37-39. (From The Wall Street Journal, February 19 & 25, 1963)

There are more women in management, expecially in public relations and advertising, but prejudice and special problems still exist.

/8/ Armour, Richard. Executive sweet. Management Review, June 1963, 52, 22-23.

A satirical poem concerning male response to management women.

/9/ Women at the top. Management Review, August 1966, 55, 70-73. (From Newsweek, June 27, 1966)

Women in management face barriers and special problems and must have high ability in order to succeed, although barriers are lowering.

/10/ Famularo, Joseph J. Women at the top--the record, the obstacles, the outlook. Management Review, August 1967, 56, 55-58. (From Journal of College Placement, April-May 1967)

Given the shortage of managerial men, and the civil rights act, there is opportunity for managerial women. Few women succeed now, but growth is expected and training is needed. Male prejudice is a barrier but should decrease.

/11/ Buchanan, Estill. The growing opportunities for women in management. Management Review, September 1968, 57, 60-65. (From Colorado Business Review, May 1968)

The shortage of managers is critical: women are needed to fill the gap. Corporate prejudices have limited women in the past, but corporations can learn to develop women as managers.

/12/ Buchanan, Estill. The case for women in management. Management Review, December 1969, 58, 20-25. (From Personnel Administration, September-October 1969, 32, 21-6)

Women are needed to fill the shortage of managers. Corporations can develop plans to utilize women effectively.

/13/ Levy, Robert. The woman who wasn't there. Management Review, September 1972, 61. 63-65. (From Dun's, June 1972, 99, 63-5)

Women are not yet equally represented in executive positions; its hard to find qualified women. Search for managerial women is due to legislation rather than altruism, and bias still exists.

/14/ Koff, Lois Ann. Age, experience, and success among women managers. Management Review, November 1973, 62, 65-66 (From The Personnel Administrator, July-August 1973)

A report of a research project which describes the characteristics of managerial women.

/15/ Meyer, Pearl. Women executives are different. Management Review, May 1975, 64, 43-45. (From Dun's Review, January 1975, 105, 46-8)

Business must learn how to attract women to managerial positions; incentives aren't the same for women as for men.

/16/ York, Lyle. What mother never told you about life in the corporation. Management Review, April 1976, 65. 13-19.

The guidelines to success in management are the same for both men and women.

/17/ Schwartz, Eleanor B. and MacKenzie, R. Alec. Time-management strategy for women. Management Review, September 1977, 66, 19-25.

The female manager who runs both a home and a career must manage time efficiently, more so than males.

/18/ Things are looking up for the white collar women--so they say. Management Review, July 1978, 67, 55.

Polled women managers felt generally satisfied with pay, promotions and job stress levels.

/19/ Sargent, Alice G. The androgynous blend: best of both worlds? Management Review, October 1978, 67, 60-65.

Organizational and personal politics aside, a combination of both masculine and feminine traits may provide the proper recipe for a "perfect" manager.

/20/ Amundson, Kristin. Building teamwork and avoiding backlash: keys to developing managerial women. Management Review, February 1979, 68, 55-58.

The state of California developed a training project to integrate women into its governmental management structure, team work as a top priority.

/21/ Canadian firm merges management and motherhood. Management Review, July 1979, 68, 41.

A Canadian firm helps women to manage motherhood and managerial careers.

/22/ Women as a management presence. Management Review, October 1979, 68, 4.

The 1980s will see a continuing rise to positions of power and influence by women, now only 2% of executives.

/23/ Stanek, Lou Willet. Women in management: can it be a renaissance for everybody? Management Review, November 1980, 69, 44-48.

Instead of sharing the best features of traditional sexual roles, men and women seem to emulate the other sex's more extreme traits. The fears of both sexes must be addressed.

/24/ Are women managers different from men? Management Review, December 1980, 69, 52.

Women managers are essentially like male managers.

/25/ Sheppard, I. Thomas. Rites of passage. . . women for the inner circle. Management Review, July 1981, 70, 8-14.

The inner circles of corporate leadership need to be opened to all competent comers, including women. Corporation must spot talented women and develop them for management.

/26/ Baron, Alma S. and Abrahamsen, Ken. Will he--or won't he--work with a female manager? Management Review, November 1981, 70, 48-53.

An instrument can help companies identify the qualities of male managers that indicate a greater willingness to work with and mentor woman managers.

/27/ Beyond tokenism on corporate boards. Management Review, December 1981, 70, 46-47.

Women board directors may be commonplace by the mid-1980s; gains have been made, but women still have a long way to go. Factors leading corporations to recruit women directors may also lead to reform of the board structure itself.

Appendix B

Number of Thought Units Per Content Category Per Article

CONTENT CATEGORY	ARTICLE # (see Appendix A)																										*SCOPE	**INTENSITY
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27		
I. Presence																													
1. Women managers are increasing	1	1	2	1			1	1	1	2		1					1					2	1			1	1	14	17
2. Opportunities for women managers are increasing	3	2							2	16	4	4	5		3					1			4		3	1		12	48
3. Women are underrepresented in management	2	2		2		1			1	1		2	1		2							1		1	1		2	13	19
4. Women are more suited for some managerial jobs	1	1					1			1		1																5	5
II. Special Problems																													
1. Prejudice against women as managers exists	1	2	2	1		3	2	1	3		3	5	3	1		3				1			2		7			16	40
2. Prejudice against women as managers is diminishing.	2		1	3					2	3	1					2		4		1						1		10	20
3. Management is a man's world		1					1												2	1		2	3					6	10
4. Women as women have liabilities as managers		4	4	1	3	1	2	1	2	4	4	6	4	1		3	6		1	4	2	3	1		1			21	58
5. Women must excel to succeed as managers					1	1	1		2	1			1			2	2											8	11
III. Femininity/Masculinity																													
1. Femininity/masculinity is an important issue for women as managers			1	1		1		1	3	1						3			6			1	6		1			11	25
2. Women as women have special skills as managers				2	1	1			1	4	8	7		15		1	8	1		7	1	3	1		2			16	63
3. Women and men have the same skills and needs as managers						1				1	7	5				15			1				2	2				8	34
4. The modern corporation needs "androgynous" managers										1	6	5				1							6		1	1		7	21

*Scope: total articles containing category **Intensity: total thought units containing category

References

Bormann, Ernest G. Fantasy and rhetorical vision: the rhetorical criticsm of social reality. Quarterly Journal of Speech, December 1972, 58, 396-407.

Bowman, G. W., Worth, N. B. & Greyson, S. A. Problems to review: are women executives people? Harvard Business Review, July 1965, 43, 52-67.

Brock, Bernard. Rhetorical criticism: a Burkeian approach. In F. L. Brock & and R. L. Scott (Eds.), Methods of rhetorical criticsm. Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1980.

Cascio, Wayne. Applied psychology in personnel management. Reston, Virginia: Reston Publishing Company, Inc., 1978.

Gerbner, George. Toward "cultural indicators": the analysis of mass mediated public message systems. In G. Gerbner, O. R. Holsti, K. Krippendorff, W. J. Paisley & P. J. Stone (Eds.), The analysis of communication content. New York: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 1969.

Gusfield, Joseph. The literary rhetoric of science: comedy and pathos in drinking driver research. American Sociological Review, February 1976, 41, 16-34/

Hatlen, Theodore W. Orientation to the theatre. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1972.

Hennig, Margaret & Jardim, Anne. The managerial woman. Garden City, New York: Anchor Press-Doubleday, 1977.

Janowitz, Morris. Content analysis and the study of sociopolitical change. Journal of Communication, Autumn 1976, 26:4, 10-22.

Kanter, Rosabeth Moss. Men and women of the corporation. New York: Delta Books, 1977.

Koester, Jolene Mary. Rhetorical visions of female managers in popular self-help books. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1980.

Leavitt, Harold J. & Lipman-Blumen, Jean. A case for the relational manager. Organizational Dynamics, Summer 1980, 27-41.

Nichols, Marie. Kenneth Burke and the "new rhetoric." In J. L. Goldern, G. F. Berquist & W. F. Colman (Eds.), The rhetoric of western thought, 2nd ed. Dubuque: Kendall/Hunt Publishing, 1976.

Nye, Russell B. Notes for an introduction to a discussion of popular culture. Journal of Popular Culture, February 1962, 10, 1031-1038.

Powell. Gary N. & Butterfield, D. Anthony. The "good manager": masculine or androgynous? Academy of Management Journal, June 1979, 22:3, 395-403.

Terborg, James R. Women in managemen: a research review. Journal of Applied Psychology, 1977, 62:6, 647-664.

U. S. Department of Labor. Handbook of Labor Statistics, 1968. Washington, D. C., U.S. Printing Office, 1968.

U. S. Department of Labor. Handbook of Labor Statistics, Washington, D. C., U. S. Printing Office, 1980.